An Introduction to the Study of Indian History by D. D. Kosambi
Review by: A. K. Warder
Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland, No. 1/2 (Apr., 1958), pp. 94-95
Published by: Cambridge University Press
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/25202144
Accessed: 25/06/2014 06:38

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Cambridge University Press and *Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland* are collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society of Great Britain and Ireland.*

http://www.jstor.org

This content downloaded from 188.72.127.68 on Wed, 25 Jun 2014 06:38:26 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

India, namely religion. As in the field of Indian Islamic studies there is nothing remotely rivalling the achievements of Goldziher, Caetani, Margoliouth, Nicholson, Massignon, Gibb, and Arberry in the general sphere of Islamic civilization, the efforts being made in both India and Pakistan to investigate the social and intellectual history of medieval Muslim India should be watched with interest. In this work the Muslim University of Aligarh is leading the way and it is pleasant to welcome Dr. Khāliq Aḥmad Niẓāmī's biography of one whom Professor Gibb describes in the foreword as a " seminal personality in the development of the Islamic mystical movement in India ".

Dr. Niẓāmī is fully aware of the difficulties awaiting the biographer of a medieval saint when hagiologists are more concerned to edify by retailing pious legends than to write historical biography. His own biography, however, does not entirely escape being a medieval hagiology itself, and although there is a useful appendix (B) on apocryphal Malfūz literature attributed to Shaikh Farīd-u'd-dīn, one feels that the credentials of the Fawā'id-u'l Fu'ād, the Khair u'l Majālis, and the Siyar u'l Auliyā, on which Dr. Niẓāmī relies heavily, need similar critical analysis, which they have not, in fact, received.

As Dr. Niẓāmī points out, authentic information on the shaikh's teachings is meagre and those of his sayings quoted by Amīr Khwurd in the Fawā'id u'l Fu'ād scarcely amount to a distinctive doctrine. Perhaps they would acquire more significance in the wider setting of medieval Muslim mysticism. It would be interesting to see how far Professor Muhammad Habib's dictum (*Medieval India Quarterly*, i, 2, 1950, p. 2) that " India has added nothing to (Muslim) mystic thought " and that " her contributions have been primarily to the field of mystic practice " can be related in detail to Shaikh Farīd-u'd-dīn's life and work.

It is now accepted doctrine that, in Dr. Niẓāmī's words, the Sufi " Khanqahs became veritable centres of cultural synthesis " between Hindu and Muslim. May one hope that the supporting evidence from the Muslim mystic literature may soon be more fully displayed ? Dr. Niẓāmī would perhaps agree that, within the context of the biography of a single saint, this need is unlikely to be satisfied.

P. HARDY.

AN INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY OF INDIAN HISTORY. By D. D. KOSAMBI. lix, 384 pp., 30 plates, 48 text-figures. Bombay: Popular Book Depot, 1956. Rs. 18–12–0.

Professor Kosambi's book is inspired by science and empiricism, not by dogma and prophecy. It is a collection of essays and empirical inquiries spaced out at roughly equal intervals over the millenia, not a systematic introduction to Indian history (" Study " is the operative word in the title). Kosambi certainly has not gone far enough

This content downloaded from 188.72.127.68 on Wed, 25 Jun 2014 06:38:26 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

in his chapter on " Scope and Methods ", and some students may find his partial criticism of Marx confusing because not sufficiently elaborated. We must note Kosambi's statement that his studies " have been intensive rather than extensive ". Immense labour on the details of Indian history must precede generalizations. Meanwhile, the research worker must proceed to test such working hypotheses as he thinks useful. Kosambi has contributed to the understanding of particular episodes, and by his example he has made an essential contribution to the great debate on writing Indian history. He has also given what seems to be the most serious and interesting attempt so far to apply Marxist theory to the study of history outside Europe.

Chapters 6–10 are more successful, or more interesting, than the earlier part of the book. With his research on the coinage of Kosala and Magadha Kosambi is more sure of his ground and more " intensive ". We have room to note here only the pioneering contribution to the question of " feudalism " in India. The characterization of European " feudalism " attempted by Maurice Dobb (*Studies in the Development of Capitalism*, Routledge and Kegan Paul, London, 1946, 36 f.): *not* by Marion Gibbs as erroneously stated by Kosambi on p. 370) is used to test Indian developments. The question remains open as to what is a useful definition of " feudalism ", if indeed it proves possible to retain the term (and here we glance at Needham on Chinese " feudalism ", in two stages: *Science and Civilization in China*, Vol. i, pp. 85, 90 ff., 100 ff.). The distinction of both " slaveholding " and " feudal " societies as stages in the development of civilization seems now inadequate, and we feel the need for some deeper analysis. After all, Marx began his analysis of capitalism with the commodity, not with the wage-earner or with the capitalist.

If some readers find Kosambi too terse and outspoken, they should be mollified by the charming examples of domestic and military (elephant) economy and of religious cults recorded in and around his home in Poona.

A. K. WARDER.

LA VIE PUBLIQUE ET PRIVÉE DANS L'INDE ANCIENNE (II^{e} siècle av. J.C.—VIII^{e} siècle env.). *Fascicule VI. Les jeux et les jouets.* By JANINE AUBOYER. pp. xi + 51, 15 plates. Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1955.

This is the first to appear of ten volumes in which the *realia* of ancient India, as depicted in sculpture and painting, are to be classified, illustrated, and discussed. The whole series will include studies of architecture, furniture, vehicles, arms and tools, clothes, coiffures, and jewellery. The final volume will present an overall picture of early Indian daily life. Apparently it is not the intention of the author to give an exhaustive survey of her themes from literary sources,

This content downloaded from 188.72.127.68 on Wed, 25 Jun 2014 06:38:26 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions